
Title registration for a systematic review: The methodological and reporting characteristics of Campbell reviews: a systematic review

Xiaoqin Wang, Vivian Welch, Liang Yao, Julia Littell, Yaolong Chen, Jianjian Wang, Xiao Liu, Huijuan Li, Meixuan Li, Larissa Shamseer, Kehu Yang, Jeremy Grimshaw

Submitted to the Coordinating Group of:

Crime and Justice

Education

Disability

International Development

Nutrition

Social Welfare

Methods

Knowledge Translation and Implementation

Other:

Plans to co-register:

No

Yes Cochrane Other

Maybe

Date submitted:

Date revision submitted:

Publication date: 22 January 2019

Title of the review

The methodological and reporting characteristics of Campbell reviews: a systematic review

Background

The Campbell Collaboration undertakes systematic reviews of the effect of social and economic policies, and seeks to help policymakers, practitioners, and the public to make well informed decisions about policy interventions by promoting positive social and economic change through the production and use of systematic reviews and other evidence synthesis for evidence-based policy and practice [1]. The Methodological and reporting Expectations of Campbell Collaboration Intervention Reviews (MECCIR) provides detailed methodological expectations for conducting Campbell reviews [2]. However, to date we know little about how Campbell reviews are conducted and reported. In 2016, Page et al examined the epidemiological and reporting characteristics of a cross-sectional sample of systematic reviews in biomedical areas and found that many systematic reviews were poorly conducted and reported [3]. The proposed review will apply the methods of Page et al to explore the methodological and reporting characteristics of Campbell reviews and determine the impact of the MECCIR standards.

Policy relevance

The Campbell Collaboration is committed to producing and maintaining high quality systematic reviews in social sciences. The MECCIR (Methodological expectations for Campbell Collaboration Intervention Reviews) were adopted in Campbell reviews to improve standards of conduct and reporting Campbell reviews. The Campbell Collaboration has just brought on a full-time editor in chief (VW) in support of reaching this goal. In order to identify priorities for editorial processes and improvement, there is a need to assess the current reporting characteristics of Campbell reviews.

Objectives

The review has three objectives:

1. Assess the methodological quality of Campbell reviews
2. Assess the reporting characteristics of Campbell reviews
3. Assess differences between the reporting characteristics of Campbell reviews published from 2011 Jan to 2014 Sep and 2014 Oct (when the MECCIR was adopted) to 2018 Jan?

In addition, the review will consider the following two subgroup analyses to compare reviews in terms of their methodology and reporting characteristics:

1. Compare methodological quality and reporting characteristics across different coordinating groups

2. Compare methodological quality and the reporting characteristics of Campbell reviews co-registered with Cochrane with those not co-registered

Existing reviews

There are no existing reviews comprehensively investigating the methodology and reporting characteristics of Campbell reviews.

We are aware that researchers from China analyzed the publication characteristics of Campbell reviews and presented on the Global Evidence Summit in 2017, but only described some basic characteristics and was limited by its scope [4].

Type of study

This is a review of the Campbell systematic reviews to explore methodology and reporting characteristics.

Type of method

Descriptive study of the methodological and reporting characteristics of Campbell reviews. Uncontrolled pre post analysis of methodological and reporting characteristics following the introduction of MECCIR standards. We will adapt the data abstraction form from the Page et al study to assess the methods and reporting and use AMSTAR 2 to assess the methodological quality of Campbell reviews. Two data abstractors (XW and LY) will independently undertake data abstraction; disagreements we be addressed by consensus or referral to JMG.

Outcomes

For the reporting characteristics across MECCIR items for Campbell reviews, data will be summarized using frequencies and percentages in tables.

The AMSTAR (A MeaSurement Tool to Assess systematic Reviews) 2 will be applied to assess the methodology quality and the overall rating of confidence in the results of each review will be applied.

Study designs

Interventional systematic reviews about effectiveness with full review published in the Campbell Library. We will include Campbell systematic reviews with full review published between 2011 Jan to 2018 Jan. There were 52 full reviews published from 2014 Oct to 2018 Jan, and 46 published between 2011 Jan to 2014 Sep [5].

References

<https://www.campbellcollaboration.org/about-campbell/vision-mission-and-principle.html>

https://www.campbellcollaboration.org/images/pdf/MECCIR_conduct_standards_May_2017.pdf

Page MJ, Shamseer L, Altman DG, Tetzlaff J, Sampson M, Tricco AC, Catalá-López F, Li L, Reid EK, Sarkis-Onofre R, Moher D. Epidemiology and Reporting Characteristics of Systematic Reviews of Biomedical Research: A Cross-Sectional Study. *Plos Medicine*, 2016, 13(5): e1002028. doi: 10.1371/journal.

<https://www.globalevidencesummit.org/abstracts/analysis-publication-characteristics-campbell-systematic-reviews>

https://www.campbellcollaboration.org/component/jak2filter/?Itemid=1352&issearch=1&isc=1&category_id=101&ordering=publishUp

Review authors

Lead review author: The lead author is the person who develops and co-ordinates the review team, discusses and assigns roles for individual members of the review team, liaises with the editorial base and takes responsibility for the on-going updates of the review.

Name: Xiaoqin Wang

Title: PhD Candidate

Affiliation: Evidence-based Medicine Centre of Lanzhou university, Lanzhou, China; Centre of Implementation Research, Ottawa Hospital Research Institute, Ottawa, Canada.

Address: 501 Smyth Rd

City, State, Province or County: Ottawa, Ontario

Post code: ON K1H 8L6

Country: Canada

Phone: 1-613-868-9255

Email: xiaowang@ohri.ca

Co-author(s):

Name: Vivian Welch

Title: Director, Methods Centre

Affiliation: Bruyere Research Institute

Address: 85 Primrose Avenue

City, State, Province or County: Ottawa, Ontario

Post code: K1R 7G5

Country: Ottawa

Phone: 613-562-6262, ext. 2904

Email: vwelch@campbellcollaboration.org

Name: Liang Yao

Title: Research assistant

Affiliation: Clinical Division, School of Chinese Medicine,
Hong Kong Baptist University

Address: No. 7 of Baptist Road, Kowloon Tong

City, State, Province or County: Hong Kong

Post code: 518000

Country: China

Phone: +86 13919194957

Email: yaol08@126.com

Name: Julia Littell

Title: Professor

Affiliation: Graduate School of Social Work and Social
Research Bryn Mawr College, Bryn Mawr, PA,
USA

Address: 300 Airdale Road, Bryn Mawr, PA 19010.

City, State, Province or County: Bryn Mawr, Pennsylvania

Post code: 19010

Country: USA

Phone: 610-520-2619

Email: jlittell@brynmawr.edu

Name: Yaolong Chen

Title: Professor

Affiliation: Evidence-based Medicine Centre of Lanzhou
university, Lanzhou, China;

Address: 199 Donggang west street

City, State, Province or County: Lanzhou, Gansu

Post code: 730000

Country: China

Phone: +86 13893104140

Email: chenyaolong21@163.com

Name: Jianjian Wang

Title: Research assistant

Affiliation: Evidence-based Medicine Centre of Lanzhou university, Lanzhou, China;

Address: 199 Donggang west street

City, State, Province or County: Lanzhou, Gansu

Post code: 730000

Country: China

Phone: +86 18368914063

Email: 1754807090@qq.com

Name: Xiao Liu

Title: Research assistant

Affiliation: Evidence-based Medicine Centre of Lanzhou university, Lanzhou, China;

Address: 199 Donggang west street

City, State, Province or County: Lanzhou, Gansu

Post code: 730000

Country: China

Phone: +86 18393817364

Email: 2511949223@qq.com

Name: Huijuan Li

Title: Master student

Affiliation: Evidence-based Medicine Centre of Lanzhou university, Lanzhou, China;

Address: 199 Donggang west street

City, State, Province or County: Lanzhou, Gansu

Post code: 730000

Country: China

Phone: +86 18693273540

Email: 1972307224@qq.com

Name: Meixuan Li

Title: Master student

Affiliation: Evidence-based Medicine Centre of Lanzhou university, Lanzhou, China;

Address: 199 Donggang west street

City, State, Province or County: Lanzhou, Gansu

Post code: 730000

Country: China

Phone: +86 18693273540

Email: 1972307224@qq.com

Name: Larissa Shamseer

Title: PhD Candidate

Affiliation: Centre for Journalology, Clinical Epidemiology, Ottawa Hospital Research Institute, Ottawa, Canada & School of Pharmacy, University of Maryland, Baltimore, USA.

Address: 310 Main St

City, State, Province or County: Ottawa, Ontario

Post code: K1S1E1

Country: Canada

Phone: 613-618-3558

Email: lshamseer@rx.umaryland.edu

Name:	Kehu Yang
Title:	Professor
Affiliation:	Evidence-based Medicine Centre of Lanzhou university, Lanzhou, China;
Address:	199 Donggang west street
City, State, Province or County:	Lanzhou, Gansu
Post code:	730000
Country:	China
Phone:	+86 13893117077
Email:	kehuyangebm2006@126.com

Name:	Jeremy Grimshaw
Title:	Senior Scientist
Affiliation:	Centre of Implementation Research, Ottawa Hospital Research Institute
Address:	501 Smyth Rd
City, State, Province or County:	Ottawa, Ontario
Post code:	ON K1H 8L6
Country:	Canada
Phone:	613-737-8899, ext. 73810
Email:	jgrimshaw@ohri.ca

Roles and responsibilities

- Content: Xiaoqin Wang, Jeremy Grimshaw
- Systematic review methods: Vivian Welch, Jeremy Grimshaw, Julia Littell, Kehu Yang, Larissa Shamseer
- Statistical analysis: Xiaoqin Wang, Liang Yao, Yaolong Chen
- Information retrieval: Xiaoqin Wang, Liang Yao, Jian Wang, Xiao Liu, Huijuan Li, Meixuan Li, Larissa Shamseer

Funding

Xiaoqin Wang is supported by the China Scholarship Council.

Vivian Welch is supported by an Ontario Early Researcher Award (2014-2019)

Julia Littell is supported by by Bryn Mawr College.

Jeremy Grimshaw is supported by a Canada Research Chair in Health Knowledge Transfer and Uptake.

Kehu Yang is supported by Evidence Based Social Science Research Center of Lanzhou University (Project ID: LZDX-EBSS-2018001)

Potential conflicts of interest

Vivian Welch is the editor in chief of the Campbell Collaboration, Jeremy Grimshaw is the Chair of the board of the Campbell Collaboration, Julia Littell is a member of the Technical Advisory Group of Campbell Collaboration.

Preliminary timeframe

- Date you plan to submit a draft protocol: April 2018
- Date you plan to submit a draft review: June 2018